Summary for the Ad Hoc
Headboat Reef Fish Advisory Panel
Tampa, FL
December 11, 2018

Panel Members                  Council and NMFS                 Attendance-Others
Pam Anderson**                  Assane Diagne                   Jeff Barger
Randy Boggs                    Jessica Matos                    Dylan Hubbard
Clifton Cox                    Susan Boggs                     Gary Bryant
James Green                    John Froeschke                  Troy Frady
Chad Haggert                   Carrie Simmons                  Shane Cantrell
Mark Hubbard                   Matt Freeman                    
Greg Mercurio                   Jessica Stephen                  
Tom Steber                     Britni Lavine                   
Eric Schmidt                   Susan Gerhart                  
Skipper Thierry**              Andy Strelcheck                
John Williams                  
**: participated via webinar

The Ad Hoc Reef fish Headboat Advisory Panel (AP) meeting was convened at 8:30 am Tuesday, December 11, 2018. AP members suggested that a discussion on alternatives to catch shares management be added under Other Business and proceeded to adopt the meeting agenda. AP members also approved the summary of the September 2017 meeting. Recommendations made by the AP are summarized below.

Jessica Stephen presented a decision tool built to estimate initial individual allocations for the five reef fish species included in Amendment 42. Dr. Stephen reviewed the time intervals considered for allocating quota to the headboat management program and discussed alternative intervals to determine initial apportionment. Using landing scenarios provided by AP members, she generated and discussed initial individual allocations. In response to AP questions relative to units of measurement, Dr. Stephen indicated that the decision tool could be revised to express allocations in numbers of fish. AP members discussed the estimated initial allocations and made the following motions:

To make Alternative 4 in Action 7.1 the preferred.

Alternative 4. Apportion initial shares among eligible participants based on the year with the highest landings by vessel for each species during the most recent five years (2011-2015). (Motion carried 7 – 3)

To make Alternative 2a in action 7.2 the preferred.
Alternative 2. Distribute a percentage of initial shares for each species proportionally based on average landings per permit during the time interval selected in Action 7-1 and distribute the remaining percentage of the initial shares equally among LHV permit holders participating in the program. Percentages distributed proportionally and equally are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Distribution of Initial Shares</th>
<th>Proportional</th>
<th>Equal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2a</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Motion carried 9-1)

AP members discuss the potential impacts of reducing the buffer between the red snapper federal for-hire ACL and ACT. Staff noted that the buffer will be reduced to 9% for 2019. AP members approved the following motion:

**To see a descending buffer between the ACT/ACL based on compliance.** (Motion carried 10-1).

The Chair noted that the AP previously picked preferred alternatives for actions included in Amendment 42. AP members decided to maintain the previously selected preferred alternatives.

Staff presented a summary of Reef Fish Amendment 50 (state management). AP members inquired about the endorsement to the reef fish permit and about stock assessments under state management. Sue Gerhart indicated that the endorsement to the reef fish permit was for red snapper only and that NMFS would continue to perform red snapper stock assessments under state management. AP members expressed their preference for staying under federal management and approved the following motion:

**To have the for-hire sector be managed federally.** (Motion carried with no opposition).

Staff summarized a framework action considering the replacement of historical captain CMP and reef fish permits with corresponding standard for-hire permits. AP members inquired about the permit capacity of the standard permits to be issued. Staff answered that each historical captain permit would be replaced with a standard for-hire permit with the same baseline permit passenger capacity. AP members expressed support for the replacement of historical captain permits and approved the following motion:

**To recommend to the Council that the historical captain permits be standardized as written in the document.** (Motion carried with no opposition).

AP members discussed alternatives to catch shares management. Some AP members voiced opposition to catch shares and argued that current conditions worked well for the headboat
component. They also indicated that catch shares were not necessary to collect better data. AP members further discussed the future progress of Amendment 42 relative to the charter for-hire amendment (Amendment 41) and offered the following motion:

To table Amendment 41 and 42. (Substitute Motion carried 6 – 4)

AP members discussed potential negative effects on the for-hire community as a whole if the headboat component moved forward with Amendment 42 without similar progress for the charter fleet with Amendment 41. AP members unanimously approved a motion to reconsider the substitute motion initially approved to table both amendments and proceeded to further discuss the relationship between the two amendments. AP members noted that a joint meeting of the headboat and charter APs would be helpful to resolve outstanding issues between the components and further the development of both amendments. AP members approved the following motion:

To recommend the Council convene a joint meeting of the headboat and charter for hire APs to explore solutions between amendments 41 and 42 including time specific harvest windows and referendum timing, evaluate definition of head boats and how that affects allocations, and the concept to work on sector allocations for the five major reef fish species. (Motion carried with no opposition and 1 abstention).

AP members noted that sector separation, i.e., the separate red snapper quotas for the federal for-hire and private angling components, is scheduled to expire in 2022 and approved the following motion:

To remove the sunset clause from sector separation.  
(Motion carried with no opposition and 1 abstention).

AP members discussed the merits of establishing separate federal for-hire and private angling quotas for additional reef fish species and approved the following motion:

To initiate an effort to begin for-hire sector separation allocations for greater amberjack, gray triggerfish, gag grouper, and red grouper.  
(Motion carried with one opposition).

The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 pm